

Reviews and Abstracts

Kathryn Anderson and Richard Pomfret, *Consequences of Creating a Market Economy*. Cornwall, England: Edward Elgar Publishing, 2003, x + 208 pp., illustrations, maps. ISBN 1843761696, \$80.00 (cloth).

Reviewed by: **Sharon Eicher**, Assistant Professor of Economics, KIMEP [Kazakhstan Institute of Management, Economics, and Strategic Research], Almaty, Kazakhstan, eicher@kimep.kz

In a work that compares the transition economies of five Central Asian states, Anderson and Pomfret state that they will examine the characteristics of those who gained and lost in the transition in the context of differing policy environments and post-independence economic performance. This is a valiant and noble goal. However, achieving this comparison is made difficult by the availability of only one to three years' worth of household data for each country, different policy regimes occurring in different countries in different years, and the fact that transition was still in midstream when the Living Standards Measurement Studies (LSMS) data were collected. Nonetheless, the authors identify some trends, especially for Kyrgyzstan.

The book includes an introductory chapter, six chapters that reflect different aspects of transition in Central Asia, with the emphasis being placed on Kyrgyzstan, and a short conclusion. Chapters examine such topics as economic conditions before independence from the Soviet Union, the inflation shock that followed independence and policy responses in each of the Central Asian republics; Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and poverty trends from 1991 to 2000; Kyrgyzstan during the years 1993 and 1997; a cross-country comparison of expenditures per household for each of the Central Asian states; gender and labor in Kyrgyzstan; and small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) in Kyrgyzstan. Each chapter is footnoted with commentary regarding other authors' works and additional data. The book is nicely balanced by the inclusion of chapters on economic trends in the 1990s, poverty, consumption, gender and the economy, and small businesses. An additional chapter on rural-urban poverty dynamics and migration or privatization would have been useful.

The primary data source is the Living Standards Measurement Study (LSMS) series

conducted by the World Bank.¹ Surveys include 1993, 1996, and 1997 for Kyrgyzstan, 1996 for Kazakhstan, 1997 for Uzbekistan, 1998 for Turkmenistan, and 1999 for Tajikistan. There was a second, pilot study for Uzbekistan in 1997. The authors managed to obtain 1997 LSMS data for Uzbekistan and 1998 data for Turkmenistan, which are not publicly available. The data are not in a time series, but they provide snapshots of income and household demographic variables during the transition period of the mid-to-late 1990s. The 1998 LSMS data for Kyrgyzstan have not been included in the revision of the original work before its publication in book form. There is very little comparison to data from the 1989 Soviet dataset. Other secondary sources include the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development's annual Transition Report publications (<http://ebrd.com/pubs/tr/main.htm>) and Branco Milanovic's 1998 World Bank study (Milanovic 1998). The LSMS data are the only available source of household information. The book's title seems somewhat premature, since the transition is still ongoing, even if GDP has recovered to its 1990 levels.

Pomfret and Anderson estimate a binary ("yes" or "no") model to predict whether a household will be poor, given different demographic variables. Probit and Logit Models were used in the statistical analyses. These estimate the probability of an event's occurrence, given other explanatory variables. I should note that the original articles were published in professional economics journals, and the authors did not revise their original work for a broad audience. This book assumes basic econometric knowledge, which not all readers may

¹ Development Economics Research Group (DECRG) of the World Bank. *Living Standards Measurement Study of the World Bank*, <http://www.worldbank.org/lsm>. The Living Standards Measurement Study series has focused on household data collection.

be able to follow. Fortunately, information is presented clearly in the tables.

Some of the results of this work are the following:

- The coefficient for income inequality rose during transition and was higher than previously reported in Milanovic.
- The poverty headcount rose from five to 24 percent in 1987/88 to 56 to 88 percent in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan in 1995.
- Using \$2.15 per person, per day as the poverty line threshold, the percentage of those living in poverty ranged from 5.7 percent in Kazakhstan in 1996 to 65.4 percent in Tajikistan in 1999.
- In Kyrgyzstan, urban households with female heads or with children were more likely to be poor, while higher education reduced the probability of poverty. The negative impact of pensioners in the household was most significant in Bishkek.
- In comparing 1993 and 1996 data for Kyrgyzstan, Pomfret and Anderson found that households in Bishkek were wealthier while those in the mountains or the south were poorer, pensioners' incomes decreased only in the 1996 sample, and gender was not significant.
- In a cross-country comparison, the authors found that geography, number of children in the family, and education were the most significant variables to explain expenditure. The effects of education were strongest in the later (presumably more market oriented) survey.
- In Kyrgyzstan, the authors learned that the number of work hours increased between 1993 and 1997; men worked longer hours and received more pay, but the gender-based wage-gap decreased.
- Household composition influenced the decision to own a business, as did education, ethnicity, and having young, but not elderly, adults in the household.
- Cost factors (taxes and input costs) were more significant problems to business owners than corruption, bureaucracy or lack of credit.

It is unfortunate that most of the data are from the mid-1990s. In this respect, the book is dated.

However, a view of what was happening during the reform process is also quite valuable. Analyses here indicate that some of the "stylized facts" about poverty in Central Asian transition economies may not hold up under scrutiny. Families with children are hurt the most economically, especially by the decrease in social spending. Working women may actually be doing better economically relative to working men. Pomfret and Anderson clearly show which geographical regions need development assistance and aid the most.

A minor, but somewhat disturbing, point is the manner in which comparisons of 1993 and 1996/97 were described. We can compare the LSMS data from Kyrgyzstan and show whether there was an improvement or worsening of conditions, but the authors write as if a continuous time series were present. Because of data limitations, analysis can only be discrete (using two points in time), rather than continuous (a series of observations are available over time), but the wording often suggests continuity. The editing of the book also leaves much to be desired. Paragraph indents are missed, the wrong year has been left in one graph, paragraphs are broken where they should not be, and bar graphs are quite difficult to read.

The emphasis of the book is Kyrgyzstan only because Kyrgyzstan has collected more than one complete LSMS dataset. Data limitations are a constant problem for economists working in transition economies. More data from Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, and Turkmenistan are needed to justify this book's claim to compare economic transition among five Central Asian states. Additional material could have been included, such as the newer LSMS data for Kyrgyzstan and data from other sources. Kazakhstan, for example, has very good statistical yearbooks published by the National Statistical Agency, and United Nations Development Program (UNDP) poverty studies for these countries also could have helped, although they do not contain household data as do the LSMS surveys.

The assumption in Western economics has always been that transition to a market economy will be costly in terms of welfare, but the benefits will be worth it — that competition will induce efficiency and a higher standard of living for all concerned. Much of the research conducted by the few economists who study the former Soviet Union has been on the "market" aspect of these social changes: stabilizing GDP, privatization statistics, investment

statistics, and creating financial and governance institutions. Little work has been done, outside of organizations such as the International Labor Organization and the UNDP, to show the internal dynamics of reform. Western economists generally do not often delve into households and firms to see how these changes are impacting individuals at

ground zero. Pomfret and Anderson do so. In these regards, this book breaks new ground.

Reference

Milanovic, Branko

1998 *Income, Inequality and Poverty during the Transition from Planned to Market Economy*. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

Glenn R. Mack and Joseph Coleman Carter, *Crimean Chersonesos: City, Chora, Museum, and Environs*. Austin, Tex.: University of Texas Press for the National Preserve of Tauric Chersonesos and the Institute of Classical Archaeology, 2003, xix + 232 pp., maps, tables, bibliographies, index. ISBN 0970887922, \$35.00 (pbk.).

Reviewed by: **Charles C. Kolb**, Senior Program Officer, Division of Preservation and Access, National Endowment for the Humanities, Washington, D.C., ckolb@neh.gov

The University of Texas-Austin's Institute of Classical Archaeology (ICA) has conducted significant archaeological research in Calabria and the Italian Metaponto. In 1992, shortly after Ukraine become an independent nation, the authorities there invited the ICA to collaborate in an archaeological project in the *chora* [agricultural lands] of Chersonesos, a settlement characterized as the "Slavic Pompeii" (although no modern city was ever built over it). ICA joined the National Preserve of Tauric Chersonesos (NPTC) in this research. The region, one of the most secret places of the Cold War, is adjacent to Sevastopol, which served as the homeport for the Black Sea Fleet since 1804. A NPTC-ICA partnership and 50-year plan is under way to explore and manage the region's archaeological resources. Chersonesos is included on the 2002 World Monuments Fund Watch List of 100 Most Endangered Sites and nominated as a UNESCO World Heritage site. The Crimea is, of course, legendary for recent historical events, such as the Crimean War, the Nazi invasion, and the Yalta Conference.

This volume is the initial major NPTC-ICA publication and a joint effort of their combined staffs, who did original research and wrote the text. The 28 collaborating authors are from Ukraine, the United States, Canada, Czechoslovakia, Germany, Italy, Poland, and Russia. There are 15 chapters, 15 maps, 324 figures (including 19 reconstructions and 13 plans), a chapter-by-chapter selected bibliography (564 items), general readings (55 entries), a detailed index, and "Crimean Chronology" (40,000 BCE to

2,000 CE). Most of the references are in Russian, Ukrainian, or English. The most recent extensive account of the region is Ellis Minns' 1913 work, *Scythians and Greeks: A Survey of Ancient History and Archaeology on the North Coast of the Euxine from the Danube to the Caucasus*, making a new volume essential to scholars.

The initial chapter documents Tauric Chersonesos and a subsequent contribution considers the Crimean Peninsula, with geographic and ecological data accompanied by Landsat images and splendid three-dimensional mapping. Four brief chapters characterize Greek, Roman, and medieval Chersonesos, and modern Crimea. A peninsular extension of the Russo-Ukrainian steppe, the Crimea is the location of the Heraklian Peninsula and Chersonesos (Khersones in Ukrainian), a settlement enduring nearly 2,000 years beginning with Tauric culture of the 10th to 8th centuries BCE, documented by Herodotus (*Histories* 4.99, 103) and Strabo (*Geography* 742). Chersonesos was one of several Crimean Greek colonies and trading posts [*apoikiai* and *emporai*] during the 5th century BCE. Chersonesos endured, becoming a Roman imperial port and military post against barbarian hordes, and took Rome's side against the Bosporan Kingdom (1st century BCE), earning praise from Caesar. In the early medieval period (5th-9th centuries) Chersonesos, now called Cherson, was a Romaioi (Byzantine) *theme* [military administrative unit], trading center, and a metropolitan center of Eastern Christianity. Medieval Cherson (9th-mid 13th centuries) was a major trading center, exchanging

wood, wax, furs, amber, and slaves to the Mediterranean world in exchange for cloth, gold brocade, pepper, and Silk Road items, and it witnessed significant church construction. During its final years (second half of the 15th century), the city was depopulated. It contracted at the time of the Mongol Golden Horde and was bypassed by most Genoese and Venetian traders. Christianity expanded into Ukraine, Cherson's remaining population was mostly Greek and Romaioi, and the city was razed, presumably by steppe nomads.

Other cultures left conspicuous evidence of their presence at Chersonesos: Scythians (raiding from 300 BCE-250 CE), Sarmatians (50-200 CE), Goths (250-275), Huns (370 ff.), the Theodoro principality, Karaite Jews (4th century ff.), Khazars (Turkish nomads of the 6th-7th centuries who embraced Judaism and permitted Christian worship), Rus' (988 ff.), Mongols (1223 ff.), Genoese (1344), Crimean Tartars (1427), and Ottomans (1475 ff.). Cherson suffered a catastrophic fire (ca. 1250) and a new city was established at nearby Sevastopol, while the old city became a source of construction materials. Archaeological excavations at Chersonesos began as early as 1827 and a museum, the "Warehouse of Local Antiquities," was founded in 1892. A modern museum, located in a former monastery, contains outstanding collections of Greek polychrome grave monuments and medieval pottery (*sgraffito* and *Zeuxippos* ware).

Additional essays document the history of archaeological research, the museums, and chora. An intricate system of chora was established around 350 BCE and divided the 10,000 ha Heraklean Peninsula into farm lots with stone-paved roads, dividing walls, and farmhouses; 400 plots and other

settlement pattern evidence are visible today. The section entitled, "Ancient City Monuments" (pp. 58-119, 89 figs.) embraces 34 separate essays grouped under three topics: Major Monuments (defensive walls, city gates, citadel, barracks, agora, main street, theater, mint, water systems), Daily Life (Early Hellenistic houses, house with winery, fishmonger's house, potters' quarters, amphorae and pottery workshops, necropolis) and Religious Architecture (basilicas and churches). Three chapters provide artifact illustrations while two contributions characterize Sevastopol and other cities. Among the remarkable artifacts are the late 4th century BCE "Civic Oath of Chersonesos" stèle (p. 136), a rare, complete document of early democracy, and a footed glass bowl with golden decorated band that contains its original grave goods, six hens' eggs (p. 156). Early images reproduced from some of the 10,000 glass plate negatives are outstanding, as are the splendid color photos of architecture and artifacts.

This volume is part historical overview, part regional archaeological report, and part museum catalog, and there is something for a variety of interests — settlement analysis, craft production, diachronic sociocultural change, numismatics, and church history, among others. This remarkable general work designed for scholars and the public has a compelling and lively narrative style that engages the reader and is accompanied by extraordinary illustrations and bibliographies. This effort bodes well for future NPTC-ICA collaboration and the projected publications program. The goal of this book, to introduce a worldwide audience to this remarkable archaeological site and region, has been admirably attained.

Scott C. Levi, *The Indian Diaspora in Central Asia and its Trade, 1550-1900*. Brill's Inner Asian Library, 3. Leiden-Boston-Köln: Brill, 2002, xiv + 320 pp., maps, illustrations, appendices, bibliography, index. ISBN 9004123202, € 83, US \$99.00.

Reviewed by: **Peter B. Golden**, Professor of History, Rutgers University, pgolden@andromeda.rutgers.edu

Commercial and cultural contacts between Central Asia and South Asia have an extensive yet still relatively unexplored history. Levi's book is not only a most welcome addition to this literature, it is a move towards "a less Eurocentric perspective" (p. 1), a "re-orienting" (Frank 1998) of our view of

global historical themes. It also has much to say that is new and of importance to our understanding of the early modern and modern history of Central Eurasia.

At the very start, Levi tackles a major area of scholarly contention: the notion that Central Eurasia was plunged into a prolonged period of political

decline and economic and intellectual stagnation as a consequence of the European takeover of the movement of goods between Asia and Europe. Decline occurred in some areas, but this was, he argues, in the natural course of affairs as other regions prospered in response to new and different economic stimuli (p. 21-23). Although not unaffected, the region was not peripheralized. Rather, the "indigenous Asian trade remained lively, and much larger in its totality" (p. 82). On the basis of its extensive trade with Mughal India, Levi contends that "Turan" (Western Turkistan, Transoxiana) was very much in the global commercial loop. What had changed were the goods and direction: it was now more north-south focused. Turan exported huge numbers of horses (as many as 100,000 annually in the latter half of the 17th century, the number declining only in the 18th and especially the 19th century with the British takeover; horses were also exported to Muscovy) in exchange for Indian textiles, indigo, medicinal herbs, jewelry, and cotton (pp. 49-50, 72-77). The slave trade dating back to the Ghaznavid era was also well known, including among its victims Kalmyks, Russians, Shia (Afghan and Persian) and of course Hindus, who may have constituted as much as 50 percent of the slave population of Bukhara and Samarqand (p. 67), where they toiled on plantation-like estates. This is a subject that has been little explored.

The major players in trade were Indian caste-based family firms (p. 210), which were mostly Hindu, with some Jains, Sikhs and Muslims. The venture capitalists of their day, termed in the sources "Multanīs" (Multan was an old trading center) and later "Shikarpurīs," they largely hailed from northwestern India and were, Levi argues, fundamentally one and the same grouping, the Shikarpurīs putting perhaps greater emphasis on the "movement of capital" (p. 117-118). Building on the enormous wealth of a monetized Indian economy (a process dating to the 13th century Delhi Sultanate, p. 220), and supported and encouraged by the pro-trade Mughal, Uzbek and Safavid governments (Indian trading diasporas were active in Iran as well), these men of commerce and finance brought both goods and capital to urban and rural Turan from ca. 1550 to the 1890s. Few villages seemed to lack Indian moneylenders (p. 149-150). Intrepid commercial agents, they constantly took the profits from one venture and invested them in others, while maintaining a geographically diversified business portfolio (p. 183). Well-schooled in trade and finance by their firms, they formed permanent

communities with transient populations of men without their families. Individuals usually stayed for several years and then were rotated back to their homes and replaced by other members of the firm. At its height, there were perhaps some 35,000 members of this mobile community. Although strictly speaking not "People of the Book" (i.e., Jews or Christians), the Hindu Multanīs and Shikarpurīs were tolerated and given cultural autonomy "within the confines of their caravanserais" (p. 144). They were providers of "much-needed investment capital and other economic services" (p. 150). They did not seek integration with the host communities and consciously sought to maintain their "otherness" for both religio-cultural and commercial reasons. As resident aliens, they could "act in ways inconsistent with indigenous norms" (p. 176), especially with regard to money-lending and other interest-bearing schemes (interest could reach as high as 300%). Disliked as "usurers," they enjoyed the protection of the elite for whom they performed financial and managerial tasks (p. 177).

The British takeover of the shipment of Indian raw materials to Russian textile mills in the latter part of the 19th century, combined with the Russian conquest of Central Asia and ensuing colonial policy (largely the work of K. P. von Kaufman and his famous directive No. 8560) in the last quarter of that same century (examined in some detail by Levi), fatally undermined the more than 300 year old Indian trading diaspora of Turan. By the late 19th century more than two-thirds had returned to India. The Russian Revolution and Civil War completed the process. The census of 1926 showed only 37 Indians remaining in Central Asia.

The presence of Indian communities and trading diasporas in Central Eurasia is attested in antiquity. Scott Levi sees these ties beginning in the Kushan era (1st-3rd centuries CE) in Western Turkistan (Transoxiana), which he terms "Turan" (p. 90). However, Indian settlements in Eastern Turkistan (Xinjiang) date back to at least the 2nd century BCE, if not earlier. The kingdom of Kroraina (Chinese Shanshan and later Loulan, probably located on the northeastern shore of the Lobnor) was largely Indic. Indeed, the region was dotted with Indic tongues and writing systems (Vorob'eva-Desiatovskaia 1992, Tremblay 2001). These influences, most probably through East Iranian and Tokharian intermediaries, reached Mongolia as well. The titulature and onomastics of the Türk Qaghanate (Eastern 552-630, 687-742 CE; Western 552-766 CE) contain terms of Sanskrit

origin (e.g., the title *ishbara* from Sanskrit *ishvara* "lord" [Clauson 1972: 257]). *Sart*, an ethnic term applied in modern times to settled Turkic- and Iranian-speaking populations in Central Eurasia came into Middle Turkic, where it denoted "merchant", probably via Soghdian (cf. Soghdian *sartapao* "caravan master," [De La Vaissière 2002: 141]), from Sanskrit (*sârtha* "caravan," *sârthavâka* "caravan leader"). In the pre-Islamic era, the Soghdians constituted a trading diaspora with some similarities to the later Indian communities discussed by Levi. Stephen Dale's path-breaking work (1994) deepened the chronological framework of studies (mainly British and Russian) of the Indian trading diaspora in Central Eurasia. Dale brought us into the 17th-18th centuries, highlighting the global connections of this community and the importance of the much-neglected Russian sources. Claude Markovits (2000), focusing on one grouping (from Sind), examined its global dimensions from the mid-18th to mid-20th centuries. Levi might have looked at some of these parallels.

This brief review cannot do justice to the wealth of detail and analysis provided by the author. Levi has shown that the Indian trading diaspora, although relatively small numerically, played a vital role in the economic and ultimately political history of the region. It is essential reading for anyone interested in that history.

References

Clauson, Sir Gerard

1972 *An Etymological Dictionary of Pre-Thirteenth Century Turkish*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Dale, Stephen

1994 *Indian Merchants and Eurasian Trade, 1600-1750*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

De La Vaissière, Etienne

2002 *Histoire des marchands sogdiens* [History of the Sogdian merchants]. Bibliothèque de l'Institut des Hautes Études Chinoises, XXXII. Paris: Collège de France.

Frank, Andre Gunder

1998 *ReOrient: Global Economy in the Asian Age*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Markovits, Claude

2000 *The Global World of Indian Merchants, 1750-1947: Traders of Sind from Bukhara to Panama*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Tremblay, Xavier

2001 *Pour une histoire de la Sérinde* [Toward a history of Serindia]. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.

Vorob'eva-Desiatovskaia, M. I.

1992 "Indiitsy [Indians]." In: *Vostochnyi Turkestan v drevnosti i rannem srednevekov'e: Etnos, iazyki, religii* [Eastern Turkistan in ancient times and the early Middle Ages. Ethnos, languages, religions]. B. A. Litvinskii, ed., pp. 77-115. Moskva: Nauka.

Caroline Humphrey and David Sneath, *The End of Nomadism? Society, State and the Environment in Inner Asia*. Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1999, xi + 342 pp., maps, tables, photographs, bibliography, index. ISBN 0822321076, \$74.95 (cl.); 0822321408, \$24.95 (pbk.).

Reviewed by: **Seth Singleton**, Professor Emeritus, Pacific University, Forest Grove, Ore., USA, seth_singleton@umit.maine.edu

This valuable book is the result of the Environmental and Cultural Conservation in Inner Asia Project, completed in 1995 with MacArthur Foundation funding. The purpose of the project was to find out what has actually been happening to the environment and the pastoral way of life in

communities traditionally dependent on livestock herding in three countries, Russia, China, and Mongolia. The first and last chapters include a discussion of language, religion, and kinship, but the study does not focus on changes of language, religious belief, lifestyle, or custom. The method, an

admirable bit of social science, was to conduct detailed, on-the-ground studies in ten communities, located near each other but separated by national boundaries, and to compare the results. The easterly group of communities was located in eastern Mongolia, the Chita Province and Buryat Mongol Republic of the Russian Federation, and the Inner Mongolia region of the People's Republic of China. The other group was located far to the west, in western Mongolia, the Tuva Republic of Russia, and western Xinjiang. All of the communities but one are Mongol in language and culture; the exception is the majority Kazakh community of Handagat, in western Xinjiang.

The researchers investigated local government structures and policies, patterns of residence and kinship, movement of livestock and people from summer to winter (and in some cases fall and spring) pastures, and what the authors call "urbanism," carefully defined to mean not settlement in fixed, urban communities, but linkages of communications, goods, and services between urban centers and the pastoralists. The underlying independent variable in the study is state policies of the three countries. The dependent variables are the effects of the living conditions and livelihood of the herders and the sustainability of the pastoral environment. The findings for the ten communities are presented in detail, with dozens of essential maps, charts, and graphs.

The results imply that adaptation of traditional patterns of movement of livestock is best for the environment and for a sustainable pastoral way of life. "Nomadism" therefore should not end. However, this book is no romantic celebration of "traditional" culture. The Inner Asian pastoral way of life has never been static. In Russia, Soviet state structures, collective farm organization and mentality persist, but have lost their political support and ideological *raison d'être*. The Mongol herding communities of Chita and Buryatia have been left with fixed settlements, dependence on raised fodder rather than movement to natural pastures, and dependence on state-supplied consumer goods, fertilizers, transport, and spare parts — except that the state no longer supplies these goods, with dire results. Yet, as in other agricultural communities of Russia, there is no option to return to some previous way of life. The result is degraded pastures and a low and falling standard of living, but little incentive to risk privatization.

For Mongolia, the authors describe the prerevolutionary pattern of mobility of the herds belonging to nobles and monasteries, tended by serf herders, and note that the changes introduced in the 1923-91 communist era were not from individual private ownership to the state, but from one form of large-scale pastoral economy on behalf of ruling elites to another. The actual patterns of livestock mobility changed less than elsewhere. Consequently, the communities in Mongolia had better pastures and a more sustainable livestock economy than their Chinese or Russian neighbors. The real revolution in Mongolia has been privatization of the herds during the last decade. While explicitly rejecting nostalgia for collectivization, the authors doubt the economic viability of privatized herds in Mongolia. One effect has been an incentive to concentrate herds near Ulaan Baatar and other towns, which may degrade the nearby pastures.

The situation in China seemed the most stable of the three countries studied. As the authors point out, in the early 1990s Chinese market reforms had been in place for a decade, under unchallenged Party guidance, while Russia and Mongolia were in the midst of a revolutionary upheaval. The Chinese system combines a market economy with control by local officials: the officials allocate animals and pastures and set prices for products, but the herds are privatized to families. The goal for officials and families alike is to maximize economic return and consumption. In Inner Mongolia particularly, the authors describe communities engaged in a scramble for money regardless of the negative environmental consequences. The authors also find that in all three countries, the western communities (in Tuva, western Mongolia, and Xinjiang) have a healthier environment and less cultural stress. They do not speculate about the reasons.

The End of Nomadism? challenges several assumptions. The authors dispute the idea that nomadism is outmoded and that sedentary life is better or more economically productive, which clearly is not the case in Inner Asia. They equally challenge the romantic return to indigenous tradition. They recommend a high degree of "urbanism" — city-rural integration — in transport and communications, with the herder using truck and cell phone as he moves livestock to preserve sustainable pastures. They also challenge policies of privatization of nuclear family economic units as unsuitable and unproductive. However, they have little use for communist-era state and collective farms, which degraded pastures and forced herders

into a dispirited, static existence. Sustainable pastoralism will require active and effective local governance and leadership to improve infrastructure and prevent degradation of pastures. Just leaving "privatized" herders alone is not enough.

This volume combines exhaustive detail of interest to anthropologists and specialists in pastoral

communities with information, descriptions, and conclusions of great value to anyone concerned with Inner Asia. It would be excellent to repeat the study today, ten years on, as post-Soviet patterns and practices have become more entrenched in Russia and Mongolia and as China has continued its explosive economic growth.

K. Warikoo and Dawa Norbu, eds., *Ethnicity and Politics in Central Asia*. Denver, Colo.: iAcademic Books, 2000 [1992], x + 291 pp. ISBN: 1588680363 (pbk.).

Reviewed by: **Shahram Akbarzadeh**, Senior Lecturer in Global Politics, School of Political and Social Inquiry, Monash University, Clayton, Victoria, Australia, shahram.akbarzadeh@arts.monash.edu.au

It feels strange to be reviewing a book that was originally published in 1992. This edited volume was reprinted in 2000, no doubt in response to the growing public curiosity about Central Asia and the healthy expansion of this field of study. But it is not clear why the publisher has made no effort to update this book with more recent and up-to-date data and analysis. In the preface, for example, the editors postulate the "possibility of a marriage [between] Islamic revivalism and Central Asian post-Communist nationalism" (p. x). This may have been a reasonable expectation at the time of the first publication, but in the immediate subsequent years that idea became commonplace among scholars of Central Asia. The behavior of the ruling regimes, with the obvious exception of Tajikistan in 1992-1993, and their active promotion of "official" Islam were widely interpreted by students of Central Asia as a transparent ploy to consolidate the state-building enterprise. The outdated preface highlights an endemic problem with this reproduction.

The book is divided into five sections that range from regional politics to Afghanistan under Soviet rule. The Central Asian section, which includes five chapters, is devoted to the Soviet experience. These chapters deal with Soviet nationalities policies and cultural revival, linguistic assertiveness, demographic and ethnic growth, and

ethnic strife. Contributors explore the relationship between rapid demographic growth and the sense of national identity against the backdrop of the Soviet policy on nationalities. The consequent cultural assertiveness set the stage for the emergence of nationalist movements in the aftermath of the Soviet collapse. These developments have attracted a number of publications in the early part of the 1990s and this collection is firmly placed in that genre.

This collection offers a novel approach to studies of Central Asia in that it does not confine itself to the modern boundaries drawn by imperial powers. This is a holistic approach and covers Inner Asia, acknowledging the close historical ties between the inhabitants of Inner and Central Asia. This is perhaps the most significant contribution of this book, as so many recent publications tend to overlook historical links in the region. It is not clear, however, if this contribution to our conceptualization of Central and Inner Asia was intentional or a byproduct of the expertise of the contributing scholars who took part in the February 1990 seminar at the Jawaharlal Nehru University that preceded this book.

This collection was no doubt a significant publication in the early part of the 1990s. I am far less certain about the contribution its reproduction can make a decade later.